

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT

EASTERN DISTRICT OF LOUISIANA
OFFICE OF THE CLERK

LORETTA G. WHYTE
CLERK

500 POYDRAS ST., ROOM C-151
NEW ORLEANS, LA 70130

August 23, 2005

Richard W. Wieking, Clerk
United States District Court
Northern District of California
450 Golden Gate Avenue
16th Floor, Room 1111
San Francisco, CA 94102

RECEIVED

AUG 30 2005

RICHARD W. WIEKING
CLERK, U.S. DISTRICT COURT
NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA

In Re: MDL 1657 Vioxx Products Liability Litigation

Your Case No. C.A. 3:05-1256 Nora Olson
et al v. Merck & Co., Inc.
Our Case No. C.A. 05-3792 L (3)

Dear Mr. Wieking:

Enclosed is a certified copy of a transfer order received from the Multidistrict Litigation Panel in Washington, D.C. It instructs that the case listed above be transferred to our district for disposition pursuant to Title 28 USC 1407, as soon as possible. Our office has assigned a new civil action number to this case as referenced above.

DO NOT FORWARD THE ORIGINAL RECORD. The Honorable Eldon E. Fallon, U.S. District Court Judge issued an order directing that the transfer of records consist of only a certified copy of the complaint (including notice of removal, if applicable), any amendments, the docket sheet and the MDL Transfer Order, together with a copy of the transfer letter be forwarded to the transferor court.

Due to the high volume of cases involved in this litigation please provide paper copies of the above documents instead of simply referring to your website.
Your prompt attention in this matter is greatly appreciated.

Should you have any questions regarding this request, please contact Dina Guilbeau at (504)589-7704.

Very truly yours,
Loretta G. Whyte, Clerk

By 
Deputy Clerk

Enclosures

cc: Judicial Panel on Multidistrict Litigation

A CERTIFIED TRUE COPY

AUG 11 2005

ATTEST
FOR THE JUDICIAL PANEL ON
MULTIDISTRICT LITIGATIONU.S. DISTRICT COURT
EASTERN DISTRICT OF LA

2005 AUG 15 AM 11:56

JUDICIAL PANEL ON
MULTIDISTRICT LITIGATION

AUG 11 2005

DOCKET NO. 1657

MDL 1657

FILED
CLERK'S OFFICE**FILED**

AUG 11 2005

RICHARD W. WIEKING
CLERK, U.S. DISTRICT COURT
NORTHERN DISTRICT OF CALIFORNIA

BEFORE THE JUDICIAL PANEL ON MULTIDISTRICT LITIGATION

C 05-1256 MHP

IN RE VIOXX PRODUCTS LIABILITY LITIGATION**BEFORE WM. TERRELL HODGES, CHAIRMAN, JOHN F. KEENAN, D.
LOWELL JENSEN, J. FREDERICK MOTZ,* ROBERT L. MILLER, JR.,
KATHRYN H. VRATIL AND DAVID R. HANSEN, JUDGES OF THE PANEL****TRANSFER ORDER**

Presently before the Panel are motions, pursuant to Rule 7.4, R.P.J.P.M.L., 199 F.R.D. 425, 435-36 (2001), by plaintiffs in the 30 actions listed on Schedule A to vacate the Panel's orders conditionally transferring the actions to the Eastern District of Louisiana for inclusion in the Section 1407 proceedings occurring there in this docket. Merck & Co., Inc., favors inclusion of these actions in MDL-1657 proceedings.

On the basis of the papers filed and hearing session held, the Panel finds that these actions involve common questions of fact with actions in this litigation previously transferred to the Eastern District of Louisiana. Transfer of the actions to that district for inclusion in the coordinated or consolidated pretrial proceedings occurring there will serve the convenience of the parties and witnesses and promote the just and efficient conduct of this litigation. Any pending motions to remand to state court can be presented to and decided by the transferee judge. *See, e.g., In re Ivy*, 901 F.2d 7 (2d Cir. 1990); *In re Prudential Insurance Company of America Sales Practices Litigation*, 170 F.Supp.2d 1346, 1347-48 (J.P.M.L. 2001). The Panel further finds that transfer of these actions is appropriate for the reasons expressed in the original order directing centralization in this docket. In that order, the Panel held that the Eastern District of Louisiana was a proper Section 1407 forum for actions involving claims of liability for allegedly adverse effects arising from the ingestion of Vioxx. *See In re Vioxx Products Liability Litigation*, 360 F.Supp.2d 1352 (J.P.M.L. 2005).

To the Ohio plaintiff who argues that she does not have the resources to litigate this matter in the Eastern District of Louisiana, we emphasize that since Section 1407 transfer is for pretrial proceedings, there is usually no need for the parties and witnesses to travel to the transferee district for depositions or otherwise. *See, e.g., Fed.R.Civ.P. 45(c)(3)(A)*. Furthermore, the judicious use of liaison counsel, local counsel and steering committees will eliminate the need for most counsel ever to travel to the transferee district. And it is logical to assume that prudent counsel will combine their forces and

**CLERK'S OFFICE
A TRUE COPY**

AUG 19 2005

Judge Motz took no part in the decision of this matter.

Deputy Clerk, U.S. District Court
Eastern District of Louisiana
New Orleans, LA

Fee _____
 Process _____
 X Dktd _____
 CtRmDep _____
 Doc. No. _____

- 2 -

apportion their workload in order to streamline the efforts of the parties and witnesses, their counsel and the judiciary. This streamlining combined with the uniform case management approach already instituted by the transferee judge will foreseeably lead to an overall savings in transaction costs. See *In re Asbestos Products Liability Litigation (No. VI)*, 771 F.Supp. 415, 422 (L.D. Me. 1991).

IT IS THEREFORE ORDERED that, pursuant to 28 U.S.C. § 1407, these actions are transferred to the Eastern District of Louisiana and, with the consent of that court, assigned to the Honorable Eldon E. Fallon for inclusion in the coordinated or consolidated pretrial proceedings occurring there in this docket.

FOR THE PANEL:



Wm. Terrell Hodges
Chairman

SCHEDULE A

MDL-1657 -- In re Vioxx Products Liability LitigationNorthern District of CaliforniaEDLA
SEC. L/3

<i>Vick Kargodorian v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 3:05-937</i>	05-3791
<i>Nora Olson, et al. v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 3:05-1256</i>	05-3792

Southern District of California

<i>Robert V. Purcell v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 3:05-443</i>	05-3793
--	---------

District of Connecticut

<i>JoAnn Malek v. Eric Rosenberg, M.D., et al., C.A. No. 3:05-543</i>	05-3794
---	---------

Middle District of Florida

<i>Migna Serrano, et al. v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 6:05-170</i>	05-3795
<i>Conchita Merced-Torres, et al. v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 6:05-449</i>	05-3796
<i>Samuel Diaz, et al. v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 6:05-472</i>	05-3797
<i>Wayne Vigil, et al. v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 8:05-223</i>	05-3798

Southern District of Illinois

<i>Helen Wood v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 3:05-168</i>	05-3799
---	---------

Eastern District of Missouri

<i>Curt Meng, et al. v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 4:05-194</i>	05-3800
<i>Ronald Colbert, et al. v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 4:05-195</i>	05-3801
<i>Carver Black, et al. v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 4:05-297</i>	05-3802
<i>John Hodges, et al. v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 4:05-302</i>	05-3803
<i>Renee Lockett, et al. v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 4:05-304</i>	05-3804
<i>LeJuana Young, et al. v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 4:05-309</i>	05-3805
<i>Kathryn Pueser, et al. v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 4:05-430</i>	05-3806
<i>Chris Piechoinski, et al. v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 4:05-431</i>	05-3807
<i>Lorraine Phillip, et al. v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 4:05-433</i>	05-3808
<i>Barbara O'Bannon, et al. v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 4:05-434</i>	05-3809
<i>Mary Miles, et al. v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 4:05-435</i>	05-3810
<i>Jeffrey McDaniel, et al. v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 4:05-436</i>	05-3811
<i>Louise McCarter, et al. v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al., C.A. No. 4:05-437</i>	05-3812

- A2 -

<u>Eastern District of Missouri</u> [continued]	EDLA SEC. L/3
<i>Norma Hubbard, et al. v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al.</i> , C.A. No. 4:05-438	05-3813
<i>Delores Holmes, et al. v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al.</i> , C.A. No. 4:05-439	05-3814
<i>Terry Frame, et al. v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al.</i> , C.A. No. 4:05-440	05-3815
<i>Jane Cavins, et al. v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al.</i> , C.A. No. 4:05-441	05-3816
<i>Charlesetta Butler, et al. v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al.</i> , C.A. No. 4:05-442	05-3817
 <u>Northern District of Ohio</u>	
<i>Kimberly Kaiser, et al. v. Merck & Co., Inc.</i> , C.A. No. 1:05-776	05-3818
 <u>Western District of Pennsylvania</u>	
<i>Mary Ellen Magnifico v. Merck & Co., Inc.</i> , C.A. No. 2:05-386	05-3819
 <u>Northern District of West Virginia</u>	
<i>William David Lough, et al. v. Merck & Co., Inc., et al.</i> , C.A. No. 5:05-34	05-3820

INVOLVED COUNSEL LIST
DOCKET NO. 1657
IN RE VIOXX PRODUCTS LIABILITY LITIGATION

Kevin J. Adrian
 Brown & James
 1010 Market Street
 20th Floor
 St Louis, MO 63101

Charles Avrith
 Hughes, Hubbard & Reed, LLP
 350 South Grand Avenue
 36th Floor
 Los Angeles, CA 90071

Dan H. Ball
 Bryan Cave, L.L.P.
 One Metropolitan Square
 Suite 3600
 211 N. Broadway
 St. Louis, MO 63102-2750

Amy Bloom
 Steel Hector & Davis
 1900 Phillips Point W.
 777 S. Flagler Drive
 West Palm Beach, FL 33401-6198

Michael K. Brown
 Reed Smith, LLP
 355 South Grand Avenue
 Suite 2900
 Los Angeles, CA 90071-1514

Mark E. Burton, II
 Hersh & Hersh
 2080 Opera Plaza
 601 Van Ness Ave
 San Francisco, CA 94102-6388

Evan D. Buxner
 Walther Glenn Law Associates
 1034 S. Brentwood Blvd.
 Suite 1300
 St. Louis, MO 63117-1322

Eugene A. Cooney
 Cooney, Scully & Dowling
 Hartford Square North
 10 Columbus Boulevard
 Hartford, CT 06106-5109

S. Tessie Corbin
 Dechert LLP
 1717 Arch Street
 4000 Bell Atlantic Tower
 Philadelphia, PA 19103-2793

Kanika D. Corley
 Morris, Polich & Purdy, LLP
 1055 West 7th Street
 Suite 2400
 Los Angeles, CA 90017

Jeanette N. Dannenfelser
 Furnier & Thomas
 One Financial Way, Suite 312
 Cincinnati, OH 45242-5858

David A. Dick
 Thompson Coburn, LLP
 One US Bank Plaza, Suite 2600
 St Louis, MO 63101

Joseph A. Dolan
 Frank, Dolan & Mueller, L.L.C.
 308 N. 21st Street
 Suite 401
 St. Louis, MO 63103

Deborah C. Druley
 Sonnenschein & Nath, LLP
 One Metropolitan Square
 Suite 3000
 St. Louis, MO 63102

Jeremy R. Fietz
 Edgar Law Firm
 408 College Ave
 Santa Rosa, CA 95401

Carl Frankovitch
 Frankovitch, Anetakis, Colantonio
 & Simon
 337 Penco Road
 Weirton, WV 26062

Loren G. Freestone
 Hurst & Hurst
 401 West "A" Street
 Suite 1825
 San Diego, CA 92101

Ann E. Griffin
 Law Office Of Jason L. Mccoy
 280 Talcottville Road
 Vernon, CT 06066

Megan S. Heinsz
 Bryan Cave, L.L.P.
 One Metropolitan Square
 Suite 3600
 211 N. Broadway
 St. Louis, MO 63102

Catherine M. Hensler-Dickenson
 Husch & Eppenger, LLC
 190 Carondelet Plaza
 Suite 600
 St. Louis, MO 63105

Russ M. Herman
 Herman, Herman, Katz & Cotlar, L.L.P.
 820 O'Keefe Avenue
 New Orleans, LA 70113

Jeffrey A. Holmstrand
 McDermott & Bonenberger, PLLC
 53 Washington Avenue
 Wheeling, WV 26003-0316

Rosalie Euna Kim
 Reed Smith LLP
 Two Embarcadero Center
 Suite 2000
 San Francisco, CA 94111

Norman C. Kleinberg
 Hughes Hubbard & Reed, LLP
 One Battery Park Plaza
 12th Floor
 New York, NY 10004-1482

Andrea B. Lamere
 Schaeffer & Lamere, PC
 5512 Godfrey Road, Suite B
 Godfrey, IL 62035

Jeffrey J. Lowe
 Jeffrey J. Lowe, PC
 8235 Forsyth Boulevard
 Suite 1100
 St. Louis, MO 63105

INVOLVED COUNSEL LIST- MDL-1657

PAGE 2 of 2

Patricia E. Lowry
Steel, Hector & Davis, P.A.
1900 Phillips Point West
777 S. Flagler Drive
West Palm Beach, FL 33401-6198

Stefan A. Mallen
Bryan Cave, L.L.P.
One Metropolitan Square
Suite 3600
211 N. Broadway
St. Louis, MO 63102-2750

Marvin W. Masters
The Masters Law Firm, L.C.
181 Summers Street
4th Floor
Peoples Building
Charleston, WV 25301

Timothy F. McCurdy
Husch & Eppenger, LLC
190 Carondelet Plaza
Suite 600
St. Louis, MO 63105

Donald L. O'Keefe, Jr.
Rabbitt & Pitzer
100 S 4th Street
Suite 400
St. Louis, MO 63101-1821

Kevin F. O'Malley
Greensfelder, Hemker & Gale, P.C.
Equitable Building, Suite 2000
10 South Broadway
St. Louis, MO 63102

Gary P. Paul
Brinker & Doyen
120 S. Central Ave
Suite 700
Clayton, MO 63105

Michael J. Pitzer, Sr.
Rabbitt & Pitzer
100 S 4th Street
Suite 400
St. Louis, MO 63101-1821

Stephen J. Potter
Behr & McCarter
7777 Bonhomme Avenue
Suite 1810
St. Louis, MO 63105

J.C. Powell
Powell & Majestro, PLLC
405 Capitol Street, Suite P-1200
P.O. Box 3081
Charleston, WV 25331

John P. Rahoy
Brown & James, P.C.
1010 Market Street
20th Floor
St. Louis, MO 63101

D. Aaron Rihn
Peirce, Raimond & Coulter, P.C.
2500 Gulf Tower
707 Grant Street
Pittsburgh, PA 15219-1918

Stephen H. Rovak
Sonnenschein & Nath, LLP
One Metropolitan Square
Suite 3000
St. Louis, MO 63102

Alan G. Schwartz
Wiggin & Dana
One Century Tower
265 Church Street
P.O. Box 1832
New Haven, CT 06508-1832

Scott S. Segal
Segal Law Firm
810 Kanawha Blvd, E.
Charleston, WV 25301

Robert J. Sindyla
Sindyla, Anthony & Sindyla
7425 Royalton Road
North Royalton, OH 44133-4743

Michael J. Smith
Moser & Marsalek
200 N. Broadway
Suite 700
St. Louis, MO 63102-2730

Dori K. Stibolt
Steel Hector & Davis
1900 Phillips Point W.
777 S. Flagler Drive
West Palm Beach, FL 33401-6198

Stephen G. Strauss
Bryan Cave, L.L.P.
One Metropolitan Square
211 N. Broadway
Suite 3600
St. Louis, MO 63102-2750

Maria D. Tejedor
Attorneys Trial Group
540 N. Semoran Boulevard
Orlando, FL 32807

James E. Whaley
Brown & James
1010 Market Street
20th Floor
St Louis, MO 63101

Brett A. Williams
Brown & James
1010 Market St 20th Fl
St Louis, MO 63101

Phillip A. Wittmann
Stone, Pigman, Walther & Wittmann,
LLC
546 Carondelet Street
New Orleans, LA 70130-3588

**INVOLVED JUDGES LIST
DOCKET NO. 1657
IN RE VIOXX PRODUCTS LIABILITY LITIGATION**

Hon. Terry I. Adelman
U.S. Magistrate Judge
15.174 Thomas F. Eagleton U.S. Courthouse
111 South Tenth Street
St. Louis, MO 63102

Hon. Janet Bond Arterton
U.S. District Judge
Richard C. Lee U.S. Courthouse
141 Church Street
New Haven, CT 06510

Hon. Frederick R. Buckles
U.S. Magistrate Judge
U.S. District Court
Thomas F. Eagleton U.S. Courthouse
111 South Tenth Street
St. Louis, MO 63102-9958

Hon. Anne C. Conway
U.S. District Judge
646 George C. Young U.S. Courthouse
80 N. Hughey Avenue
Orlando, FL 32801

Hon. Patricia C. Fawcett
Chief Judge, U.S. District Court
611 George C. Young U.S.
Courthouse
80 North Hughey Avenue
Orlando, FL 32801

Hon. Jean C. Hamilton
U.S. District Judge
16N Thomas F. Eagleton U.S. Courthouse
111 South Tenth St., 16th Floor
St. Louis, MO 63102-1116

Hon. David R. Herndon
U.S. District Judge
P.O. Box 259
E. St. Louis, IL 62202-0259

Hon. Carol E. Jackson
Chief Judge, U.S. District Court
14N Thomas F. Eagleton U.S. Courthouse
111 South Tenth St., 14th Floor
St. Louis, MO 63102-1116

Hon. M. James Lorenz
U.S. District Judge
2140 Edward J. Schwartz U.S.
Courthouse
940 Front Street
San Diego, CA 92101-8913

Hon. Terrence F. McVerry
U.S. District Judge
1008 U.S. Post Office & Courthouse
700 Grant Street
Pittsburgh, PA 15219

Hon. Marilyn Hall Patel
U.S. District Judge
Phillip Burton U.S. Courthouse
Box 36060
450 Golden Gate Avenue
San Francisco, CA 94102-3661

Hon. Catherine D. Perry
U.S. District Judge
Thomas F. Eagleton U.S. Courthouse
111 South Tenth Street, 14th Floor
St. Louis, MO 63102-9958

Hon. Charles A. Shaw
U.S. District Judge
Thomas F. Eagleton U.S. Courthouse
111 South Tenth Street, 12th Floor
St. Louis, MO 63102-9958

Hon. Rodney W. Sippel
U.S. District Judge
Thomas F. Eagleton U.S. Courthouse
111 South Tenth Street, 10th Floor
St. Louis, MO 63102-1116

Hon. Frederick P. Stamp, Jr.
U.S. District Judge
P.O. Box 791
Federal Building
1125 Chapline Street
Wheeling, WV 26003-0100

Hon. E. Richard Webber
U.S. District Judge
Thomas F. Eagleton U.S. Courthouse
111 South Tenth St., 12th Floor
St. Louis, MO 63102-1116

Hon. Lesley Brooks Wells
U.S. District Judge
18A Carl B. Stokes U.S. Courthouse
801 W. Superior Avenue
Cleveland, OH 44113-1836

Hon. James D. Whittemore
U.S. District Judge
223 Sam M. Gibbons U.S. Courthouse
801 North Florida Avenue
Tampa, FL 33602

**INVOLVED CLERKS LIST
DOCKET NO. 1657
IN RE VIOXX PRODUCTS LIABILITY LITIGATION**

Geri M. Smith, Clerk
United States District Court
2-161 Carl B. Stokes U.S. Courthouse
801 West Superior Avenue
Cleveland, OH 44113

James Woodward, Clerk
3300 Thomas F. Eagleton U.S. Courthouse
111 South Tenth Street
St. Louis, MO 63102

Kevin F. Rowe, Clerk
Richard C. Lee U.S. Courthouse
141 Church Street
New Haven, CT 06510

Norbert G. Jaworski, Clerk
U.S. District Court
P.O. Box 249
E. St. Louis, IL 62202-0249

Richard W. Wieking, Clerk
Phillip Burton U.S. Courthouse
Box 36060
450 Golden Gate Avenue
San Francisco, CA 94102-3489

Robert V. Barth, Jr., Clerk
U.S. District Court
P.O. Box 1805
Pittsburgh, PA 15230-1805

Sheryl L. Loesch, Clerk
300 George C. Young U.S. Courthouse
80 North Hughey Avenue
Orlando, FL 32801

Sheryl L. Loesch, Clerk
218 Sam M. Gibbons U.S. Courthouse
801 North Florida Avenue
Tampa, FL 33602-3800

W. Samuel Hamrick, Jr., Clerk
4290 Edward J. Schwartz Federal Building
880 Front Street
San Diego, CA 92101-8900

Wally A. Edgell, Clerk
P.O. Box 471
Wheeling, WV 26003-0060